



PERMANENT HISTORIC DESIGNATION STUDY REPORT

ST. MARCUS PARSONAGE / MATHIS HOUSE

212 EAST NORTH AVENUE

SEPTEMBER 2009

PERMANENT HISTORIC DESIGNATION STUDY REPORT

I. NAME

Historic: **St. Marcus Parsonage**

Common Name: **Mathis House**

II. LOCATION **212 East North Avenue**

Legal Description - Tax Key No. 322-0241-100
JOHN B A KERN'S SUBD in SE 1 /4 SEC 17-2-22
LOTS 11 & 12 & E 16' LOT 13

III. CLASSIFICATION Site

IV. OWNER

Colleen Mathis Christian/Colleen Mathis
(Apparent heir to estate)
3391 N. 22nd Street
Milwaukee, WI 53206

City of Milwaukee

ALDERMAN Ald. Milele Coggs, 6th Aldermanic District

NOMINATOR LuAnn Paul, 2430 N. Hubbard Street

V. YEAR BUILT 1926 (permit number 14452 dated June 11, 1926)

ARCHITECT: Hugo C. Haeuser (permit number 14452 dated June 11, 1926)

VI. PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION

The former St. Marcus Parsonage is located at the northwest corner of East North Avenue and North Hubbard Street in the John B. A. Kern Subdivision. The original parcel on which the parsonage was built consisted of a 46 foot by 100 foot lot with an additional 16 feet from the adjacent lot to the west. The current 108 foot by 100 foot parcel is the result of the purchase of the corner lot, once addressed at 222 E. North Avenue. The house on that lot was demolished around 1971. Both properties are now under one tax key. The neighborhood is predominantly residential in character with houses dating from the 1880s to the early 20th century with styles including the Queen Anne, Victorian Gothic and Arts and Crafts. The houses along the north side of North Avenue tended to be large and showy examples of their styles, although many have been demolished or unsympathetically remodeled. Most of the houses are of frame construction so the St. Marcus parsonage stands out due to its brick exterior. Some corner commercial buildings were constructed along the south side of North Avenue. A number have been demolished, a few remain. A new restaurant building has recently been completed at the southwest corner of Palmer Street and E. North Avenue.

The St. Marcus Parsonage building is a two story, hip roofed, brick veneered house with elements of the Prairie and Gothic Revival styles. It was built in 1926. The house is set back from the city sidewalk a number of feet and features foundation plantings. There is a slight berm to the front yard and four concrete steps and a concrete walk lead to the front porch. The

building is located very close to its west lot line with just room for a service walk and no landscaping. The rear yard is located to the north of the house and features grass. A concrete driveway extends adjacent to what had been the original east lot line. The driveway is bordered by grass. To the east is the 46 foot by 100 foot grassy parcel that was once the location of the Richard Elsner House addressed at 222 East North Avenue. It now functions as a side yard and has a wooden shed. The property is bordered by a chain link fence.

The St. Marcus Parsonage elevations feature the “shirtwaist” proportions common with the Prairie style and has a second story that is narrower than the first. A horizontal stone beltcourse wraps the building at the height of the sills of the second story windows and adds a horizontal element to the design. Stone is also used at the sills throughout the house. The masonry extends down to the ground with no demarcation for the basement aside from the basement windows. The roof is clad in three-tab asphalt shingles. A brick chimney rises from the rear roof slope and has been extended in height. There has been some patching to the roof adjacent to the north face of the chimney. Two flat roof dormers extend from the east and west roof slopes. They are clad in what appears to be vinyl siding.

The main elevation of the former parsonage fronts south onto North Avenue. The façade is symmetrically arranged with prominent features positioned at the center, flanked by groupings of windows. The most important architectural feature is the elaborate Gothic style entry porch with shaped and pierced bargeboards and timber framing, an element reminiscent of English design. The timber work sits on brick walls capped by stone trim. Brick knee walls flank the steps. Above this porch is located a three sided oriel window with leaded glass windows on the second story. A grouping of four windows flanks the entry porch on the first story and pairs of windows flank the oriel on the second. Stone capped buttresses are located at either end of the front façade. The entry door and many windows are boarded up so details are not visible but the second story windows feature cottage style, one-over-one sash. A historic photo of the parsonage provided by St. Marcus Church shows that the windows on the first story had arched sash and that all the windows at the front facade had leaded glass.

The west elevation is simpler in design with a side entrance and windows corresponding to the various interior rooms and stairways. The entry is simple in design with no hoods or enframements. There is also a milk chute opening to the right or south of the entrance. At the roof is a dormer. Its rough construction and four-paned sash appear to have been a later addition.

The rear elevation features four window openings on the first floor and three on the second. A door to an airing porch is located on the second story. The platform and brackets survive but the porch railing is gone. The airing porch door is of three-panel three-light design.

The east elevation features a two-story rectangular bay set back near the rear of the house. Windows are arranged singly or in pairs and correspond to the interior room arrangements. The second dormer is located at the east slope of the roof and matches the construction of the west dormer.

A small one car masonry garage, with brick that matches the house, is located at the original northeast property line and is approached by a concrete driveway from North Avenue. It has a hip roof with three-tab asphalt shingles and a wood overhead door.

The shed on the corner parcel or current east side yard is of recent construction and is not contributing to this nomination.

Permit records show that there have been no major alterations to the house or garage. There are no permit records for the dormers or changes to the chimney.

VII. SIGNIFICANCE

The St. Marcus Parsonage is significant as a fine, and previously undocumented example of the work of prominent Milwaukee church architect Hugo Haeuser. The parsonage was constructed about a block away from the congregation's main campus of buildings, located at the northwest corner of N. Palmer Street and E. Garfield Avenue. Haeuser cleverly designed the parsonage to fit into its residential setting. Not overtly religious in appearance, the parsonage reads as a large residence with features of both the Prairie style and the Gothic Revival. It would be at home in most of the North Point neighborhoods. The parsonage is made of the high quality materials, brick, stone, leaded glass, detailed Gothic porch, for which Haeuser was known. Haeuser designed over 300 churches in his career, many of which were for Lutheran congregations, the denomination in which he was raised, and he also designed additions and alterations to churches designed by other architects.

VIII. HISTORY

St. Marcus Congregation

The St. Marcus Congregation has been associated with Brewers Hill from its inception. Although the plat of Sherman's Addition (most of it now part of the Brewers Hill Historic District) was recorded in 1837, making it one of the earlier subdivisions in the city, the neighborhood experienced only sparse settlement until the first portion of the Rock River Canal was constructed along with a dam across the Milwaukee River in 1842. The resulting flour mills and sawmills that located along the canal attracted hundreds of workers and soon there were tanneries and breweries in the vicinity as well. Many of those business owners and workers settled in Sherman's Addition building their own dwellings. Investors also purchased lots and constructed rental cottages and houses in the neighborhood that came to be known as Brewers Hill. By the 1870s the population in the area had grown to a critical mass and churches began to be established. A Catholic monastery was established in 1869 between 4th, 5th, Brown and Reservoir Streets, and a parish followed known as St. Francis of Assisi. Its first church was built in 1870. In 1865 a Czech/Bohemian Catholic parish was established called St. Johannes de Nepomuc. Its 1859 rectory still stands on 4th Street. The Second German Methodist-Episcopal Church was established in 1865 and located on Third Street, then later at Second and Garfield. The Zion Evangelical Church was established in 1869 at Fifth and Walnut Streets. The German Evangelical Trinity Church, a Moravian or Brethren's Church that reorganized as an independent Lutheran church, was organized in 1865 and built a church at Sixth and Vine Streets. Christ Church was a mission church that built at the corner of Fifth and Walnut in the late 1850s then relocated to Fourth between Walnut and Vine in 1873.

St. Marcus Congregation was established in 1875. Its founding members included laborers, skilled tradesmen and a professional gardener. The surnames, Harrass (or Harras), Puestrow, Helm, Erdmann, Krueger, Engel, Bismark, and Jeske, among other, show that these individuals were of German ethnicity and city directories indicate that they lived and worked in the greater Brewers Hill area. After some informational meetings, Ferdinand Harras was elected as president on June 13, 1875. Their first service was held on July 4 of that year. Soon thereafter, the congregation purchased a frame school building at the northwest corner of Garfield and Palmer Streets from St. John's Lutheran. St. John's was the oldest congregation of the Wisconsin Synod, having been established in 1848. Located at Fourth and Highland at the time, St. John's erected a branch school at Garfield and Palmer Streets in 1873 as it was outgrowing its old location. The new congregation purchased this school building from St. John's with the stipulation that they join the Wisconsin Synod. The congregation resolved to adopt the name "German Evangelical Lutheran Congregation of St. Mark." A teacher named J. B. Denninger was hired to organize a school, but he left after a short tenure. An organ was purchased and a choir was organized in 1875. Late in the year reverend Westenberger of Prairie du Chien was hired as pastor and he had the school building converted into a sanctuary. The first service in their own church was held in January, 1876.

Like many congregations, St. Marcus grew and formed a Sunday School and Ladies Society and other social groups. By 1880 there were 85 pupils in the church school and the membership numbered 57 families and a number of individuals. A frame parsonage was constructed behind or west of the church in 1884 and was later addressed as 124 E. Garfield. A new school was built of cream city brick to the north of the church in 1894. It was designed by Henry Messmer (no longer extant).

When the congregation outgrew its frame church, it secured Milwaukee architects Leiser and Holst to design a Neo Gothic Revival style church, built of brick and stone. As the congregation had limited land, the new building was constructed in 1913 on the site of the old church which had to be razed. This church from 1913 is still extant and retains much of its architectural integrity.

The frame parsonage served the pastors of St. Marcus for a number of years. Eventually, as the congregation was reaching its 50th anniversary in 1925, the need for a bigger and more modern parsonage became imperative. Being landlocked on Palmer and Garfield Streets, the congregation was able to find a vacant lot on North Avenue about a block away from the church.

The parcel purchased by St. Marcus consisted of Lot 12 of John B. A. Kern's Subdivision as well as the east 16 feet of Lot 13 to the west. The parcel had gone through a succession of owners starting in 1888 when Kern first sold the property to realtor William Schacht. The property was split but sold to the same owner in 1889, Edward Schuster. He probably held onto the land for investment purposes. Patrick H. Shaughnessy eventually acquired the parcel on April 24, 1900. He worked as the principal of the 6th District School #2, lived on Garfield Street and did not build on the parcel. Widow Evelyn M. Shaughnessy sold the parcel to St. Marcus on May 25, 1925 for \$4,000 and her daughter Catherine relinquished all claim per deed dated June 17, 1925. (Deeds 248:389; 320:109; 320:110; 396:427; 426:210; 1094:105; 1083:621)

St. Marcus Congregation hired nationally prominent, Milwaukee-based church architect Hugo Haeuser to design their new parsonage. Haeuser was at a mature point in his career, having set up his own practice in 1919. He had trained with the best, Ferry and Clas and Alexander C. Eschweiler. He was the preferred architect for Lutheran congregations, having been raised in the Lutheran faith and knowledgeable about church symbolism. Haeuser designed a unique structure for St. Marcus that fit into its residential setting. It shows elements of the Prairie style with the shirtwaist proportions, broad hip roof and horizontal emphasis. Gothic detail, which he found appropriate for ecclesiastical buildings, dominates the front porch which features an elaborate shaped and pierced bargeboard with trefoil cusps and open timberwork framing. Gothic detail is also found in the corner buttresses.

The permit for the new parsonage was taken out on June 11, 1926, about a year after the lot was purchased. The \$12,000 structure was started on June 19th and the building completed in November that year. A matching 12 by 20 foot masonry garage was built in 1930 at a cost of \$500. The brick at the front matched the house while the sides and rear were of concrete block. Pastors E.P. Dornfeld and Walter A. Gieschen served St. Marcus in 1926 but Rev. Gieschen became pastor of Jerusalem Evangelical Lutheran Church the following year. It appears that there were few changes made to the building during its ownership by St. Marcus. Permit records show little activity other than a conversion burner for the furnace and electrical outlets. There was an inquiry about building a 12 by 20 foot frame addition to the garage in 1962 but that was not constructed. The former frame parsonage on Garfield Street was retained behind the church and used as the custodian's residence for the next 70 years. It was later moved to 200 East Brown Street in 1997. The move was reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission.

The last pastor to live in the North Avenue parsonage was Rev. Paul W. Knickelbein. City directories show that he was still on the premises in 1967 but that the building was vacant in 1968. On March 3, 1968 a fire caused \$1,000 damage to the second floor joists and studs. The damage was repaired. At some point St. Marcus turned the property over to Milwaukee Housing Improvement Inc. Milwaukee Housing sold the parsonage to Reverend Lee Benefree (sometimes

spelled Beneree) and his wife Elna on August 11, 1969. Reverend Benefree was in charge of the Episcopal Diocese of Milwaukee. The Benefree's held ownership of the parsonage for only a brief time and sold the building to Edward and Louise Mathis on November 10, 1971. The house next door, addressed at 222 E. North Avenue/2307 N. Hubbard Street, was demolished around 1973, and it appears that the city of Milwaukee sold the lot to the Mathis's in 1979. During their ownership, the Mathis's constructed a 12 by 12 foot storage shed in what was now their side yard for \$400 in 1985 and clad the dormers in vinyl siding in 1991 for \$6,361. (Deeds Reel 493:Image1350; Reel 622 Image 575; Reel 1214 Image 323; Permit records, City Directories)

Edward Q. Mathis died on August 26, 1999. Louise Mathis died December 6, 2003. (Social Security Death Index) The property was owned by their estate/descendants. It has been vacant for a number of years and has recently been acquired by the city for delinquent taxes on July 20, 2009. The Department of Neighborhood Services started a raze file on the property on March 31, 2009. There have been numerous service requests to clean up garbage and debris, high weeds and grass, to board up the house, to get rid of squatters living in the house, and violation orders have included repairing gutters, downspouts, doors, windows and painting as well as repairing service walk steps, replacing missing bricks, repairing the garage and so on. It was concern over potential demolition that prompted the nominator, LuAnn Paul, a neighborhood resident, to file the petition for interim designation.

THE ARCHITECT

Hugo Haeuser (1882-1951) was nationally prominent in the field of church design. He made a specialty of Gothic and Neo-Gothic Revival style buildings and reportedly designed more than 300 churches across the United States. His trademark materials were lannon stone from the quarries in the Lannon/Sussex Wisconsin area and red tile roofs, often by Ludowici. Unless required to use brick or frame, Haeuser would ship Wisconsin lannon stone to his projects around the country. Local examples of his churches include Our Savior's Lutheran, 3022 W. Wisconsin Avenue; St. John's Lutheran, 7809 Harwood Avenue in Wauwatosa; Luther Memorial, 2840 S. 84th Street in West Allis, Christ United Church of Christ, 915 E. Oklahoma and Pentecost Evangelical Lutheran Church at 5226 W. Burleigh Street.

Hugo Haeuser was born in Milwaukee on January 14, 1882 and attended West Division High School. After graduation he worked from 1898 to 1904 as an apprentice architect and draftsman for the prestigious Milwaukee architectural firm of Ferry and Clas. Between 1905 and 1918 he worked as chief draftsman for the prominent firm of Alexander C. Eschweiler & Co. During the years of World War I when the Eschweilers were in military service, Haeuser served as the firm's chief designer. He is known to have designed some houses on Lake Drive during this time as well as the first pagoda style filling station for Wadhams Oil. The senior member of the firm, Alexander C. Eschweiler might have participated in the design of the Wadhams prototype, but Haeuser continued to receive commissions from Wadhams for most of their stations once he had set up his own practice in 1919. His offices were located at 759 N. Milwaukee Street from 1919 through 1945 then moved to 2051 W. Wisconsin from 1946 through 1951.

Haeuser was known to have been an admirer of architect Ralph Adams Cram who had offices in both New York and Boston. Like Cram, Haeuser had a love for the art and philosophy of Gothic architecture but did design in other styles like the Colonial Revival for the Christian Science churches in Waukesha and Ft. Atkinson. Haeuser was called upon to design auxiliary spaces for existing churches as well and did additions for such congregations as Epiphany Lutheran Church (All People's Gathering Lutheran Church)(locally designated January 18, 2000).

Haeuser was a master of architectural detail and particularly demanding about the quality of the stonework that went into his buildings. His son recalls many field trips to construction sites where his father would critique the quality of the work and actually pick up tools to show masons exactly how the stone should be laid. A multi-talented man, Haeuser designed the leaded and stained glass windows (which were manufactured by Milwaukee art glass companies) and light fixtures for

his churches, designed the furnishings for the churches such as carved altars, pulpits, altar rails, fonts and reredos screens, usually of white oak and designed the iron work for rails, brackets and other decorative elements.

Haeuser also excelled in water colors and played the organ, the piano and the cello. He taught classes in art and design.

Haeuser's son Charles wrote "my father was distinguished in his pursuit of religious meaning in his designs. Trained as a Lutheran in his boyhood, he knew the symbolism of the church unusually well, often being invited to give sermons on the parallels between church architecture and God's Church in its broader, spiritual context." (Wisconsin Architectural Archive. Architect Biography Card)

It appears that Haeuser also continued to design houses and commercial buildings during his career. Examples include the Arthur Haeuser (Hugo's brother) House at 2556 N. Grant Boulevard (1919), the Frank Icke House at 438 N. Pinecrest (1929), a French Norman style dwelling in the Story Hill neighborhood, and the Kriz House at 2442 N. Sherman Boulevard (1922). He also designed the building for H.H. Schwantes at 5528 W. North Avenue (1927), known for its colorful slate roof and unusual tower. Haeuser's residences and commercial buildings stand out in their neighborhoods.

Haeuser's son Charles (1923-) also became an architect and worked with his father and later a number of firms including Maynard W. Meyer & Assocs. and Grellinger & Rose Archts. (American Architects Directory, p. 276)

The Wisconsin Architectural Archive currently has approximately 160 sets of plans of Haeuser's projects including churches, Christian Science Reading rooms, and exhibition buildings for the Wisconsin State Fair, library additions, schools, apartment buildings and some residences. While he appears to have been the architect of choice for Lutheran congregations, Haeuser also designed churches for other protestant denominations including Presbyterians, Congregationalists, Methodists, and Baptists.

Haeuser was a member of Wauwatosa Lodge F. & A. M., the Kenwood Chapter of the Royal Arch masons and the City Club. He was also a member of the American Institute of Architects and its Wisconsin affiliate. Haeuser died on October 18, 1951 at the age of 69 after an illness of several months, just before his last Neo Gothic style church, Our Savior's Lutheran, was completed. ("Haeuser, 69, Church Architect, Dies" Milwaukee Journal October 19, 1951) The St. Marcus Parsonage at 212 E. North Avenue is a previously unidentified work of Haeuser from his mature period. It demonstrates his ability to combine the more modern Prairie style with traditional Gothic design detail and produce a very substantial and eye-catching commission that fits into its neighborhood setting and bridges the gap between ecclesiastical and secular design.

SOURCES

American Institute of Architects. American Architects Directory. New York: R.R. Bowker Co., 1956

"Haeuser, 69 Church Architect, Dies". Milwaukee Journal. October 19, 1951.

Milwaukee City Building Permits, 212 East North Avenue

Milwaukee City Directories.

Milwaukee County Register of Deeds.

Sanborn Insurance Maps of Milwaukee, Wisconsin. New York: Sanborn-Perris Map Co., 1888, 1894, 1910.

Social Security Death Index. Online Index <http://ssdi.rootsweb.ancestry.com/cgi-bin/ssdi.cgi>

Wisconsin Architectural Archive. Architect Biography Card for Hugo Haeuser.

IX. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the St. Marcus Parsonage/Mathis House be given permanent historic designation as a City of Milwaukee Historic Structure as a result of its fulfillment of criteria e-5, e-6 and e-9 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 308-81(2)(e) of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances.

- e-5. Its embodiment of the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or specimen.

Rationale: The St. Marcus Parsonage/Mathis House is a fine example of a large, well-crafted parsonage building that exhibits characteristics of both the Prairie and the Gothic Revival styles. The Prairie style is evident in the shirtwaist proportions, the horizontal emphasis of the stone beltcourse and the broad, monolithic hip roof. Gothic features include the front porch and corner buttresses. The front porch is the signature feature of the building, with highly detailed and ornamental bargeboards and timberwork framing that is reminiscent of English design. It plays off against the simpler body of the house in a manner that shows its architect was a masterful designer.

- e-6. Its identification as the work of an artist, architect, craftsperson or master builder whose individual works have influenced the development of the city of Milwaukee, state of Wisconsin, or of the United States.

Rationale: Architect Hugo Haeuser had national prominence as a church designer. He trained in the studios of Milwaukee's best architects of his day and went on to design over 300 churches, many in the Midwest and Wisconsin, and many for Lutheran congregations. Haeuser also designed auxiliary buildings and additions to existing churches, as the St. Marcus Congregation Parsonage. The parsonage was built away from the main church campus and used different color brick and because it was set between existing houses, it combined both secular and ecclesiastic details. His preference for Gothic design is evident in the outstanding porch at the St. Marcus Parsonage. His insistence on expert craftsmanship in construction is also evident in this commission.

- e-9. Its unique location as a singular physical characteristic, which represents an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community or the city of Milwaukee.

Rationale: The former St. Marcus Parsonage stands out among the other houses on East North Avenue. Its size, masonry construction and bold Gothic detail are unique among the surrounding buildings from earlier decades.

X. PRESERVATION GUIDELINES

The following preservation guidelines represent the principal concerns of the Historic Preservation Commission regarding this historic designation. However, the Commission reserves the right to make final decisions based upon particular design submissions. Building maintenance and restoration must follow accepted preservation practices as outlined below. Given the level of detail on this house, review of maintenance projects with historic preservation staff is required.

A. Roofs

Retain the roof shape. Skylights are discouraged but may be added to roof surfaces if they are not visible from the street or public right of way. No major changes can be made to the roof shape of the St. Marcus Parsonage, which would alter the building height, roofline or pitch. The plain, uninterrupted hip roof profile at the front of the house is important to the Prairie lines of the house. Locate mechanical systems and vents on portions of the roof not visible at all from the public right of way and paint them out to minimize impact. If the building gets re-roofed, consultation with historic preservation staff is required to review and approve the new material, flashing, and gutters. The placement and size of any satellite dish are subject to review by staff and the commission. Retain the existing original chimney if possible. No rooftop construction is allowed, as this would interfere with the viewing of the house and its profile. The existing dormers may not be original to the house. Any removal or re-cladding will be reviewed by preservation staff. The construction of new dormers or other rooftop features, addition of skylights and satellite dishes, and re-roofing require review by Historic Preservation staff and a Certificate of Appropriateness.

B. Materials

1. Masonry

- a. Unpainted brick, terra cotta, or stone must not be painted or covered. Painting masonry is historically incorrect and could cause irreversible damage if it was decided to remove the paint at a later date. Covering masonry with other materials (wood, sheet metal, vinyl siding, etc.) is not allowed.
- b. Repoint defective mortar by duplicating the original in color, hardness, texture, joint finish and joint width. See the masonry chapters in the books, As Good As New or Good For Business for explanations on why the use of a proper mortar mix is crucial to making lasting repairs that will not contribute to new deterioration of the masonry. Replaced mortar joints should be tooled to match the style of the original. Do not use mortar colors and pointing styles that were unavailable or were not used when the building was constructed. Consultation with historic preservation staff and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required before starting any repointing.
- c. Clean masonry only when necessary to halt deterioration and with the gentlest method possible. Sandblasting or high pressure water blasting or the use of other abrasive materials (soda, nut shells, etc.) on limestone, terra cotta, pressed brick, cream brick or other styles of brick surfaces is prohibited. This method of cleaning erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Avoid the indiscriminate use of chemical products that could have an adverse reaction with the masonry materials, such as the use of acid on limestone. Work should be done by

experienced individuals. Consultation with historic preservation staff and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required before any cleaning would begin.

- d. Repair or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the old as closely as possible. Do not use new material that is inappropriate for the time period when the building was constructed. Consultation with historic preservation staff and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required before attempting work on the masonry. The masonry portion of the front porch and the brick knee walls flanking the front steps may not be removed or covered over with other material. The front porch may not be enclosed or altered from its historic appearance.

2. Wood/Metal

- a. Retain original material, whenever possible. Do not remove architectural features that are essential to maintaining the building's character and appearance.
- b. Retain or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Do not cover architectural features with new materials that do not duplicate the appearance of the original materials. Covering wood or metal with aluminum or vinyl or other substitute material is not permitted. Ornamental wood details, from the front porch bargeboards to the front oriel window and elsewhere may not be removed or altered except to restore their appearance. Spot replacement or spot repair of any deteriorated bargeboards, timberwork, porch ceilings, and other wood elements is encouraged rather than complete removal and replication. Any new elements must replicate the pattern, dimension, spacing and wood species of the original. Retain rear airing porch with its brackets and tongue-in-groove soffit. New railings can follow examples in Living With History and require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

C. Windows and Doors

1. Retain existing window and door openings. Retain the existing configuration of panes, sash, surrounds and sills, except as necessary to restore to the original condition. Do not make additional openings or changes in existing fenestration by enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock window sash or new stock door sizes. Do not change the size or configuration of the original windowpanes or sash. Use storm windows or protective glazing which have glazing configurations similar to the prime windows and which obscure the prime windows as little as possible.
2. Respect the building's stylistic period. If the replacement of doors or window sash is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design and material of the original window sash or door. New glass must match the size of the historic glass. Avoid using inappropriate sash and door replacements. Do not fill in or cover openings with inappropriate materials such as glass block or concrete block. Do not use modern style window units, such as horizontal sliding sash or

casements, in place of double-hung sash or the substitution of units with glazing configurations not appropriate to the style of the building.

Any original windows on the St. Marcus Parsonage should be retained and repaired if at all possible, especially any leaded glass windows. That includes windows throughout the house. Vinyl, vinyl clad, metal, and metal-clad or fiberglass prime window units are not permitted. If new windows are required, replacements will be of wood and match the cottage style of the originals. The doors at the front of the house and at the side porch were not visible at the time of this nomination. If the original doors are still extant, every effort should be made to preserve them. If that is not possible, then replacement doors should be appropriate to the historic period of the house, the style of the house, and fit into the original opening. Any changes to doors and windows, including installation of new doors and windows, require consultation with Historic Preservation staff and a Certificate of Appropriateness.

3. Steel bar security doors and window guards are generally not allowed. If permitted, the doors or grates shall be of the simplest design and installed so as to be as unobtrusive as possible. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required for this type of installation.

D. Trim and Ornamentation

There should be no changes to the existing historic trim or ornamentation except as necessary to restore the building to its original condition. Replacement features shall match the original member in scale, design, color and appearance. Existing historic trim in wood and stone, found on the porch and sills and throughout the building, shall not be removed unless it is for the purpose of repair. Consultation with Historic Preservation staff is required before any changes or repairs are made to the building.

E. Additions

No additions will be permitted on the south (front), east (right side) or west elevation (left) elevations of the St. Marcus Parsonage as this would destroy the character defining features of the building. Any other addition requires the approval of the Commission. Ideally an addition should either compliment or have a neutral effect upon the historic character of the building. Approval shall be based upon the addition's design compatibility with the building in terms of window size and placement, building height, roof configuration, scale, design, color, and materials, and the degree to which it visually intrudes upon the principal elevations or is visible from the public right of way. Additions must be smaller than the building and not obscure the historic building.

F. Signs/Exterior Lighting

The installation of any permanent exterior sign or light fixture shall require the approval of the Commission. Approval will be based on the compatibility of the proposed sign or light with the historic and architectural character of the building. Consultation with Historic Preservation staff is required to assist in the selection of exterior fixtures. Plastic internally illuminated box signs are not permitted.

G. Site Features

New plant materials, paving, fencing, or accessory structures (garden sheds, storage sheds, and gazebos) shall be compatible with the historic architectural character of the building and requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. Any rear deck or patio installation requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. No retaining wall is permitted along the front of the property. The current chain link fence may remain. If replacement is considered, new fencing will follow the examples in Living With History and As Good As New. The current concrete driveway was placed in its location before the acquisition of the lot to the east. It may remain. Any changes to the location of the drive will require consultation with preservation staff and a Certificate of Appropriateness. The garage at the rear of the property was built shortly after the parsonage and is part of this nomination. Work on the garage, such as roofing, new garage doors, masonry repair and so on will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. Consultation with Historic Preservation staff is required before starting any work that would involve the landscape features, the position of the driveway and service walks and new construction.

H. Guidelines for New Construction

It is important that new construction be designed to be as sympathetic as possible with the character of the structure. No principal dwelling or structure shall be constructed in the rear yard. Small-scale accessory structures, like a gazebo or fountain, may be permitted depending on their size, scale and form and the property's ability to accommodate such a structure. No large, multi unit residential or commercial, industrial, office, medical or religious development can be built in the east, side yard. A single family house had once stood on that site; it was later converted to multi-family. Any request to construct a new garage or small scale single family house, or moving an existing historic house to the site would be subject to review for code compliance and appropriate design and would require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

1. Siting

New construction must respect the historic siting of the building. It should be accomplished so as to maintain the appearance of the building from the street as a freestanding structure.

2. Scale

Overall building height and bulk, the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof, and individual building components, such as overhangs and fenestration that are in close proximity to a historic building must be compatible to and sympathetic with the design of the building. New construction is to be smaller in size and shorter in height than the historic building.

3. Form

The massing of the new construction must be compatible with the goal of maintaining the integrity of the building as a freestanding structure. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and receded from the main block should express the same continuity established by the historic building if they are in close proximity to it.

4. Materials

The building materials which are visible from the public right-of-way and in close proximity to the historic building should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials used on the historic building. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained and materials not available when the house was constructed should be avoided.

I. Guidelines for Demolition

Although demolition is not encouraged and is generally not permissible, there may be instances when demolition may be acceptable if approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. The following guidelines, with those found in subsection 9(h) of the ordinance, shall be taken into consideration by the Commission when reviewing demolition requests.

1. Condition

Demolition requests may be granted when it can be clearly demonstrated that the condition of a building or a portion thereof is such that it constitutes an immediate threat to health and safety and is beyond hope of repair. See the section on Masonry above with regard to the porches.

2. Importance

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is of historical or architectural significance or displays a quality of material and craftsmanship that does not exist in other structures in the area.

3. Location

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building contributes to the neighborhood and the general street appearance and has a positive effect on other buildings in the area.

4. Potential for Restoration

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is beyond economically feasible repair.

5. Additions

Consideration will be given to whether or not the proposed demolition is a later addition that is not in keeping with the original design of the structure or does not contribute to its character.

212 E North Avenue
 St. Marcus Parsonage
 July 2009

